

5 GREAT WESTERN MAIN LINE

5.1 GWM 1.1.1 Truncate West Wales Services at Swansea

5.1.1 Specification

There are two round trips between Swansea and Carmarthen currently in the morning and evening which are tailored for the peak market to and from London. In this option these trains are cut back to Swansea but passengers for Carmarthen will be able to make connections on ATW services. These are due to become hourly clockface from December 2005.

1745 Paddington to Carmarthen terminates at Swansea
0734 Carmarthen to Paddington starts from Swansea at 0830

There is no change in rolling stock requirements.

5.1.2 Qualitative Criteria: Deliverability and Performance

It is likely that train service operations would become less complex and therefore easier to deliver by ceasing to operate west of Swansea, with the associated empty stock moves.

5.1.3 Qualitative Criteria: Other

The service truncation may have a slightly negative effect on rail contribution to the market, the local economy and social inclusion. It is not consistent with some stakeholder objectives, e.g. the Welsh Assembly.

5.1.4 Financial and Economic Appraisal

Costs (£kPV)	-2,743
Total Revenue (£kPV)	-1,596
User Benefits (£kPV)	-5,948
Non- user Benefits (£kPV)	-1,021
Net financial effect (£kPV)	1,146
Net economic effect (£kPV)	-5,822
Benefits : cost Ratio	3.1
NPV / K	n/a
Subsidy / passenger mile (£)	0.08
Subsidy / passenger journey (£)	5.75

- Marginally better in financial terms
- Substantially worse in economic terms

The truncation of the peak west Wales services at Swansea leads to user and non-user disbenefits as longer distance passengers from beyond Swansea face interchange penalties as a through service is no longer available. As there is no saving in rolling

stock requirements the cost savings of this option are relatively modest, this combined with the passenger disbenefits leads to a substantial negative net economic effect.

5.1.5 Recommendation

Reject

5.2 GWM 1.1.2 Further intercity extensions west of Swansea

5.2.1 Specification

To test the market for additional trains to and from Carmarthen, two further morning and evening trains are extended from Swansea. The following shoulder peak trains have been selected for extension between Swansea to Carmarthen calling at the times shown:

0630 Swansea – Paddington: Carmarthen 0534, Ferryside 0545, Kidwelly 0551, Pembrey 0558, Llanelli 0604, Swansea arr 0623
 0730 Swansea – Paddington: Carmarthen 0634, Ferryside 0645, Kidwelly 0651, Pembrey 0658, Llanelli 0704, Swansea arr 0723
 1545 Paddington – Swansea: Swansea dep 1851, Llanelli 1909, Pembrey 1915, Kidwelly 1921, Ferryside 1927, Carmarthen 1940
 1645 Paddington – Swansea: Swansea dep 1951, Llanelli 2009, Pembrey 2015, Kidwelly 2021, Ferryside 2027, Carmarthen 2040

There is no change in rolling stock requirements.

5.2.2 Qualitative Criteria: Deliverability and Performance

No material train performance impact is likely. No significant deliverability issues have been identified.

5.2.3 Qualitative Criteria: Other

The service extension may have a slightly positive effect on rail contribution to the market, the local economy and social inclusion. It supports some stakeholder objectives, e.g. the Welsh Assembly.

5.2.4 Financial and Economic Appraisal

Costs (£kPV)	5,062
Total Revenue (£kPV)	771
User Benefits (£kPV)	2,691
Non- user Benefits (£kPV)	461
Net financial effect (£kPV)	-4,291
Net economic effect (£kPV)	-1,139
Benefits : cost Ratio	0.8
NPV / K	-0.27
Subsidy / passenger mile (£)	0.68
Subsidy / passenger journey (£)	57.73

- Substantially worse in financial terms
- Marginally in economic terms as a result of the improved benefits to passengers travelling West of Swansea.

The introduction of additional intercity extensions west of Swansea does not lead to an overall gain financially or in net economic terms. There is low demand for these

additional services leading to little additional revenue gain and comparatively low user benefits. These factors are not sufficient to counterbalance the cost of these services.

5.2.5 Recommendation

Reject

5.3 GWM 1.1.3 Truncate Swansea Peak Half-Hourly Services at Cardiff

5.3.1 Specification

In the morning and evening London peak periods the hourly Cardiff trains are extended to Swansea to make two trains per hour. This proposal tests the value of the extension of these services. The following trains terminate at Cardiff Central:

Paddington to Swansea 1515, 1615, 1715

The following trains start from Cardiff Central:

Swansea to Paddington 0600, 0700, 0800

There is no change in rolling stock requirements.

5.3.2 Qualitative Criteria: Deliverability and Performance

No material train performance impact is likely. Deliverability may be an issue because of the location of the rolling stock depot at Swansea, which may cause additional empty stock mileage to be required.

5.3.3 Qualitative Criteria: Other

The service truncation may have a slightly negative effect on rail contribution to the market, the local economy and social inclusion. It is not consistent with some stakeholder objectives, e.g. the Welsh Assembly.

5.3.4 Financial and Economic Appraisal

Costs (£kPV)	-3,227
Total Revenue (£kPV)	-1,823
User Benefits (£kPV)	-4,950
Non- user Benefits (£kPV)	-984
Net financial effect (£kPV)	1,404
Net economic effect (£kPV)	-4,530
Benefits : cost Ratio	2.4
NPV / K	n/a
Subsidy / passenger mile (£)	0.12
Subsidy / passenger journey (£)	5.28

- Marginally better in financial terms
- Significantly worse in economic terms

Although this scheme has a slightly positive financial impact, longer distance passengers from beyond Cardiff face significant disbenefits. Overall this leads to a substantially negative net economic effect.

5.3.5 Recommendation

Reject.

5.4 GWM 1.1.4 Extend Cardiff half-hourly services to Swansea

5.4.1 Specification

In this option the hourly off-peak service between Paddington and Cardiff is extended to Swansea to give 2tph all day. The following trains are extended between Cardiff Central and Swansea calling as specified at the stated minutes past the hour:

0715, 0815, 0915, 1015, 1115, 1215, 1315 and 1415 Paddington – Cardiff Central.
Cardiff Cen dep XX28, Bridgend XX48, Port Talbot XX00, Neath XX08, Swansea XX20

0955, 1055, 1155, 1255, 1355, 1455, 1555, 1655, 1755 and 2125 Cardiff Central – Paddington.

Swansea XX00, Neath XX11, Port Talbot XX19, Bridgend XX31, Cardiff Cen arr XX52

The change in resources required will be one additional HST diagram.

5.4.2 Qualitative Criteria: Deliverability and Performance

There may be a negative effect on performance due to the additional train paths which will be required between Cardiff and Swansea.

5.4.3 Qualitative Criteria: Other

This option may prevent other operators from using paths required between Cardiff and Swansea. The service extension may have a slightly positive effect on rail contribution to the market, the local economy and social inclusion. It supports some stakeholder objectives, e.g. the Welsh Assembly.

5.4.4 Financial and Economic Appraisal

Costs (£kPV)	34,993
Total Revenue (£kPV)	3,656
User Benefits (£kPV)	11,242
Non- user Benefits (£kPV)	2,091
Net financial effect (£kPV)	-31,337
Net economic effect (£kPV)	-18,004
Benefits : cost Ratio	0.5
NPV / K	-0.57
Subsidy / passenger mile (£)	1.17
Subsidy / passenger journey (£)	44.65

- Substantially worse in financial terms
- Substantially worse in economic terms.

This option presents a significant cost increment through the requirement of another HST unit. The user benefits of this scheme are not sufficient to counter this high cost.

5.4.5 Recommendation

Reject.

